Building a complete picture of feedback: How extreme is too extreme?



Jared Siegel, Leah Bigwood, Masaya Yamamoto & Jan McCarthy

Cosmic shear challenges: modelling baryon feedback





[adapted from DESY3, Amon+21]





Cosmic shear challenges: modelling baryon feedback





[Preston, Amon & Efstathiou 23]





Rubin is here



kSZ + X-ray predict different feedback strengths?







Leah Bigwood

DES Y3 cosmic shear + Akino X-ray gas fractions

DES Y3 cosmic shear + ACT-BOSS kSZ

[Bigwood, Amon+24]





kSZ + X-ray predict different feedback strengths? Towards a complete picture of feedback

• Results unphysical due to baryonification over-flexibility?

---> test with FLAMINGO

- kSZ probe <u>different halo masses</u> to X-ray gas fractions? —> analyze kSZ(mass)
- kSZ probe <u>different redshifts</u> to X-ray gas fractions? \rightarrow analyze kSZ(z)
- kSZ <u>scale extent</u> not captured by simulations? —> jointly model X-ray & kSZ
- Systematics in X-ray measurements and/or kSZ?

---> well characterized samples

• FLAMINGO odd? —> test with other sims



Towards a complete picture of feedback : kSZ profiles + X-ray gas fractions + galaxy-galaxy lensing





Halo Mass $[M_{500}/M_{\odot}]$





Analyzed with: +lan McCarthy FLAMINGO simulations

flexible baryonification model 2.



R [arcmin]



Galaxy-galaxy weak lensing: for accurate halo mass selection



lensed background source galaxies (DES + KiDS + HSC)





[McCarthy, Amon, FLAMINGO+ 24]





eROSITA X-ray gas fractions: extreme feedback



Towards a complete picture of feedback : kSZ profiles + X-ray gas fractions + galaxy-galaxy lensing









The importance of sample selection for studying kSZ in simulations





ACT + DESI kSZ: Consistent with extreme feedback





[Siegel+ (in prep.)] [McCarthy, Amon, FLAMINGO+ 24]

eROSITA gas fractions + kSZ: Consistent with extreme feedback



eROSITA gas fractions + kSZ: Consistent with extreme feedback



At Rubin-relevant redshifts (z < 0.7), across a range of masses, the kSZ & X-ray fgas tell a consistent story: well described by FLAMINGO's extreme feedback variant.

- How do simulations produce this without breaking other observations?
- Selection effects in older X-ray gas fractions?





ACT + DESI kSZ at higher-z: unexplored territory





ACT + DESI kSZ at higher redshift: what about other hydro-sims?







ACT + DESI kSZ at higher redshift: what about other hydro-sims?





Masa Yamamoto Leah Bigwood

We are establishing a consistent picture of feedback with joint kSZ + X-ray gas fractions + GGL masses





Ian McCarthy Masa YamamotoLeah Bigwood



Test models of baryon feedback: Joint analysis of weak lensing + kSZ

X-ray informed by SUC Methods fracti gas

Discard measurements on scales impacted by feedback (acc. to OWLS AGN hydro-sim)

Halo model approach (calibrated to BAHAMAS hydro-sim)

Emulator built from ANTILLES hydro-sims, with X-ray prior

Analytic model based on N-body simulations, flexible to reproduce a range of hydro-simulations

+ kSZ to constrain model parameters

Gas priors are important! Do X-ray and kSZ give a consistent view of feedback?



[Bigwood, Amon+24]





kSZ + X-ray predict different feedback strengths?



[Bigwood, Amon+24]





